

Recommendations for Changes
to
Guide Lines for
Security Classifications
Section I - General

1. Section I, para. 1: The sentence reading "Each item of information or material must be adjudged solely on its own merits and shall be classified according to its own contents" should be underlined and stressed. It appears that even though this is the true criterion in the determination of classification, it is all too frequently ignored. Common criteria have been such thoughts as "this other document is classified this or that; this one should be the same", or "let's make it TOP SECRET Codeword and be safe", and so on. NSA 9303

NO

NO 2. Page 3, Paragraph 3 - Underscore the whole paragraph. S/Asst (F)

3. Section I, para. 3 - The principle seems clear but its application is uncertain. Perhaps the expression "pertaining to NSA activities" should be phrased more precisely. NSA 72

4. Section I, para. 4: The "distinctive codeword" mentioned here should be further expanded here or elsewhere in the document to include a full explanation of the purpose, use and meanings of the Indian codewords, the source codewords (without actually referring to any specific ones), and last, but not least, the COMINT codewords which are so common throughout the Agency, yet so misunderstood and misused. NSA 9303

? 5. Page 3, - Insert the definition of COMINT (Appendix B, Page 11) between paragraph 4 and paragraph 5. S/Asst (F) NO

Yes 6. Page 3, Paragraph 5 - The third sentence should read: "Initially, COMINT material comes to ..." S/Asst (F) YES

NC 7. "Page 3, para 5. A considerable portion of COMINT is received initially in the agency in the form of end-product from foreign collaborating centers and from field stations. This volume will grow as decentralization progresses. Paragraph 5 should be modified accordingly." NSA 76 NO

✓ 8. Section I, paragraph 5, (page 3). "security" (appears twice) should be "quality", "nature", "sensitiveness" or something else, not "Security". R/D YES

Guide Lines For Security Classification

Section I - General (Cont'd)

- 9. Page 4, Paragraph 5a - Recommended: "Cryptintelligence is that COMINT which results from cryptanalysis of the systems utilized by message originators to protect the traffic during its transmission. This includes [redacted] S/Asst (F) Yes
- 10. Paragraph 5b - Recommended: "Traffic Intelligence is that COMINT which results from traffic analysis and from plain texts. This includes COMINT produced by all means short of the actual cryptanalysis of intercepted communications." S/Asst (F) Yes
- 11. Paragraph 5a - Omit.
- 12. Paragraph 6 - Recommended: "Information derived from these processes (cryptanalysis and traffic analysis is)... " S/Asst (F) Yes
- 13. Paragraph 6a - The second sentence should read: "... of certain high level systems as specified by existing authorities." S/Asst (F) Yes
- 14. Paragraph 6b - Recommended: "Category II COMINT is less sensitive than the preceding category in that protection of its source is not always the over-riding consideration and is one which can, by acceptance of a calculated risk, be disseminated with a less rigid standard of security." S/Asst (F) Yes
- 15. Page 5, Paragraph 6b - "This category will include security systems as specified by existing authorities. It is... " S/Asst (F) Yes
- 16. Paragraph 6c - Recommended: "... low level COMINT as specified by existing authorities. Material ..." S/Asst (F) Yes
- 17. Paragraph 7a - Recommended: "... mutually agreed upon by UK and US to be in other categories. This list" S/Asst (F) Yes
- 18. 3. Section I, para. 7a: It would be well to include the specific systems referred to in this paragraph under Sections IV and V or perhaps as an appendix to the basic document with periodic revisions thereto. NSA 9303 No
- 19. Para. 7.d. - First line should read "In reference to type of crypto systems." NSA 72 Yes
- 20. Page 6, Paragraph 8 - Recommended: "As a means of further assistance to personnel within NSA the following classification guide lines have been established. Remember they are only general in nature and that the classification of any given item must be established SOLELY ON ITS OWN MERITS." S/Asst (F) Yes

Guide Lines for
Security Classification

Section II - Top Secret Codeword

- No. 21. Section II, paragraph 2, (page 7). Sentence would be clarified by inserting the word "intelligence" before the period. NO
R/D
- 22. Section II, para. 2 - Last sentence undoubtedly means [redacted] and it should say so. NO
NSA 72

23. Re Section II TOP SECRET CODEWORD. Item 2 of inclosure to reference, the following revision is suggested:

2. Intelligence derived from the study of [redacted] NO
[redacted] and is of such high intelligence value or sensitivity as to require assignment to this Category." (NSA 75)

24. Section II - TOP SECRET CODEWORD - Paragraph 4 - TOP SECRET CODEWORD
material includes much more than just cryptanalysis [redacted] NO
This should include all cryptosystems used by the foreign governments, such as those used by the various services, Army, Navy, Air Force; the quasi-military organizations, border guards, security police; internal governmental and commercial; clandestine or illicit organizations. *NSA 70*

25. Add Section II, paragraph 5, (page 7). Security studies of US & UK systems, whether in being or proposed. NO
R/D

26. Add Section II, paragraph 6, (page 7). Certain special purpose cryptanalytic machines. NO
R/D

27. Section II should also include:

- 1. ~~Crypt Intelligence except where specifically assigned to other categories.~~
- 6 2. "Traffic Intelligence involving such combination of ^{cryptanalysis} ("fusion") of separate Traffic Intelligence ^{of other} Category II sources as produces information whose value is so great that security of content becomes the over-riding consideration. YES
- 7. "Material involving sensitive collection procedures or the revelation of success against unusual, sensitive or complex transmission procedures and devices." *S/Asst (F)* NO

Guide Lines for
Security Classification

Section III - Top Secret

28. Section III, para. 2: After "U.K." add "and Canadian". (See D/F on "Discussion of Security Classification Matters Within PROD-No. 3", dated 23 June 1954).
NSA 9303

29. Section III, paras. 4 and 5: Recommend that both these items be downgraded to SECRET. It does not appear necessary that the codewords themselves need to be classified any higher than SECRET, and in some cases only CONFIDENTIAL, even though they may be covering information of much higher sensitivity. This would be an application of the same principle as was used in specifying that the cryptanalytic short titles themselves should be classified only SECRET. NSA 9303

✓ 30. Paragraph 6 - Omit

S/Asst (F)

yes

SECTION IV - SECRET CODEWORD

31.

Section IV should also include:

S/Asst (F)

"Crypt^{analytic} Intelligence specifically assigned to Category II."

yes

removed from Cat II cryptosystems

Section V - Secret

✓ 32. Section V, paragraph 5, (page 8). Certain of this equipment is unclassified.
R/D

✓ 33. Section V, para. 7: After "U.S." sentence should read "and UK (GCHQ), Canada (CBNRC), and Australia (D3B) in the COMINT field". NSA 9303

yes?

34. Section V, paragraph 10, (page 9). Query as to what is an "entire system"? NOMAD is properly unclassified.

R/D

NO

h. What about descriptions of cryptosystems?

R/D

NO

35. Section V, para. 11 - This probably means "UKUSA, short titles of crypt systems"? The intent is not clear. NSA 72

NO

Guide Lines for
Security Classification

Section VI - Confidential

36. NO Section VI, para. 9 and 10 - Intent is not clear. NSA 72 NO

already covered

Para. 11 - Does this mean systems that were already dead by Sept. 1939? Does "specific" mean there is a list somewhere or does it refer to any system? NSA 72 NO

37. Para. 12 - (Same question about the dates.) NSA 72 - and not used since ✓

38. NO Section VI, para. 13 - Not clear. Does this mean that a case number by itself is Confidential? NSA 72 NO

Section VII - Unclassified

39. Section VII, para. 1 - Entire paragraph is vague and imprecise. NSA 72 NO

40. Page 11, Paragraph 1 - Recommended: "... service cryptologic agencies as a whole; and association of NSA with the Service cryptologic agencies as a whole." S/Asst (F) YES

41. Para. 2, also para. 13 - Surely anything "in the public domain" is unclassified. Could example be added? NSA 72 NO

42. Section VII, para. 8: This paragraph will have to be altered if comment above is accepted. NSA 9303 YES

43. Para. 9 - Is this really true and if so shouldn't it be reconsidered? Isn't it dangerous and inviting trouble to leave security clearance data unsafeguarded? NSA 72

Perhaps mention re index would solve prob.

see comments

Guide Lines for
Security Classification
Section VII - Unclassified (Cont'd)

#4. Addition to Section VII

Paragraph 8, Section V, page 9 classifies as SECRET "all personnel reports for the entire Agency, civilian or military, which indicate authorized or actual strength by organizational element, short title or symbol, or by function". No provision, however, has been made for other required personnel reports which do not reveal organizational structure but which may indicate total authorized and actual strength. It is therefore recommended that the following paragraph be added in Section VII - UNCLASSIFIED:

"All routine personnel reports (except as provided under paragraph 8, Section - SECRET) which indicate total or partial strength, separations, accessions, or similar general information, provided such reports do not reveal organizational element(s), specific job titles, job speciality codes, short title/symbol, function, or other data which may be considered classified."

CIV PERS

No
at
16
5
pg

(NO)

4.5. In addition to the above comments, we believe that the following items are among those which should also be listed under the appropriate Section for the classification recommended herein:

1. case notations, message short titles not specifically named elsewhere, report short titles, serials and symbols - to be classified CONFIDENTIAL.
2. various categories of IIM runs - to be classified as appropriate.
3. details as to the contents, purpose and usage of various categories of formats used within the Agency and in the field - to be classified as appropriate.
4. details as to the various types of technical services performed within the Agency, such as microfilming, laboratory services, reproduction, Emergency Records Program, forms control, distribution, sorting, mailing, etc. - to be classified as appropriate.
5. discussion of non-routine policy matters, such as field missions, collaboration and functions; decentralization of problems and controls; reporting missions and responsibilities; NSA commitments; etc. - to be classified TOP SECRET.

with an info
even more to

(NO)

NSA 9303