

~~SECRET~~~~SECRET - U.S. EYES ONLY~~~~TENTATIVE~~

FINAL

SUBJECT NUMBER

USCIB: 9.3/43      Item 1 of the Agenda for the Twenty-ninth (Special) Meeting of USCIBEC, held on 28 April 1955.

Subject:            USCIB COMINT Requirements List (CRL)  
(USCIB 9.3/37, 39, 42).

The CHAIRMAN (Captain Taylor) stated that the purpose of the meeting was to consider adjustment of the three (State, CIA and Air Force) COMINT Requirements Lists into a single list which could be recommended to USCIB as a USCIB CRL. He suggested that, as a starter, the Committee decide whether or not the State Department list was usable and if so could it be combined with the CIA and Air Force lists.

CAPTAIN HOLTWICK expressed his pleasure with the State list and commented that while the list is not quite in the ultimate form for a general list, with further subdivision and some rearrangement it would come close to what NSA had envisioned as a CRL. The CIA and Air Force lists, he said, fulfill steps in arriving at a CRL.

MR. O'GARA stated that the Army would go along with any list. He suggested that even though the Army had not had much luck with State's concept there is so much promise in the State list that the Committee should try it as a basis for submission of new Board guidance to NSA.

CDR BRINGLE said that the Navy is in favor of getting a list to NSA right now and that the CIA list is a good beginning. He felt that the State list is workable but didn't think it takes care of the Military Services sufficiently.

MAJOR MORRIS stated that the Air Force would be satisfied with a considerably condensed version of their list as long as there is a handle to which supplemental guidance to NSA could be adapted at a later date. He said that the Air Force had not attempted to put their requirements in the form used by State but were willing to try.

expressed the view that the CIA substantive approach is basically the most sound. He felt the State approach is more in the nature of supplemental guidance. He said that CIA is willing to try to work their requirements into the State list but as a matter of principle is against it.

MR. GODEL stated that from the Defense point of view he thought the State approach to be almost perfect. He agreed that a certain amount of military phraseology must be added. He envisaged that Defense would ultimately get from USCIB a relatively complete packet of papers, the

USCIB: 9.3/43

- 3 -

OGA

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 9.3/43

first of which would be a letter similar to the one State had drafted. The second would be similar to State's Basic Requirements List (a list of COMINT objectives) which would describe to General Canine how he should divide his pie. The third piece would be the principles of supplemental guidance and the fourth would be a consolidated list of Air Force, CIA, State, Army and Navy EEI. He said the latter paper would be an initial presentation of specific requirements and would be a continuing proposition changing from day to day. He suggested that the Committee start with the State paper and attempt to reach agreement on the cutting of the pie. He stated that in his opinion the CIA and Air Force lists were really EEI and could be consolidated at a later date with the EEI of the other members.

MR. POLYZOIDES explained that he is interested in a method of procedure which would avoid the insufficiencies of the previous MRL and would lead as directly as possible to allocation of production resources. In preparing State's paper, the effort had been made to avoid old methods which had been rejected by NSA. He felt the State list to be extremely flexible and adaptable to the needs of the other agencies. When combined with the requirements of the other members it would not increase unduly in bulk. He pointed out that the State paper is directed against communications complexes not communications links and hoped that the Committee would choose to give the State approach a try.

CAPTAIN HOLTWICK agreed with Mr. Godel that the CIA and the Air Force lists were EEI and constituted supplemental guidance. He stated that for the Committee to address itself now to supplemental guidance would be putting the cart before the horse and suggested that the CIA and Air Force lists be put aside, allowing the supplemental guidance mechanism which has already been approved take care of those lists.

During the discussion which followed it was agreed that the State list should be examined in order to determine whether or not military and CIA requirements could be included. It was further agreed that while the CIA and Air Force lists could be combined, the State list is not compatible due to a difference in basic concept.

DECISION: (28 April 1955) It was decided to form an ad hoc committee composed of Mr. Patton, OSD, as Chairman and including representatives from State, CIA and Air Force to study the State paper and to attempt to mold basic requirements of the other members into that form. It was agreed that the problem of coordinating supplemental guidance is to be handled by the Chairman, USCIBEC.

The meeting adjourned at 1515.

USCIB: 9.3/43

- 4 -

(Corrected page)