

~~SECRET~~KINAC
~~TENTATIVE~~~~SECRET - U.S. EYES ONLY~~SUBJECT NUMBER

USCIB: 9.3/40 Item 3 of the Agenda for the 27th Meeting of USCIBEC, held on 25 March 1955.

Subject: USCIB Master Requirements List (USCIB 9.3/30,/32,/33).

The CHAIRMAN (Captain Taylor) introduced discussion of this item with a brief review of actions taken since the previous meeting. He said that he had called together five members of the Committee (Army, Navy, Air Force, State, and CIA) informally to discuss procedural and other aspects of the problem, and he thought the discussion had done much to clear the atmosphere and head the Committee in the right direction. The group was of the opinion, he said, that USCIBEC would agree to attack the several aspects of the problem separately, saving the question of the COMINT Requirements List (CRL), for example, for consideration at a special meeting of the Committee next week. He invited comments on this latter proposal.

CAPTAIN HOLTWICK said he believed it unrealistic to jump straight to the CRL, in that the ad hoc committee had, in its report, set forth five steps (TAB A) which it thought should be accomplished before attacking the CRL. He suggested this as a more orderly and logical procedure for study of the problem.

The CHAIRMAN stated that the ad hoc committee plan to develop a requirements list based on National objectives was not being rejected, but rather, that the intervening actions mentioned by Captain Holtwick need not be considered necessary as formal steps. He explained that the group, which did not include NSA representation, felt that the intelligence consumers were best equipped to determine what the intelligence requirements, COMINT and otherwise, are and that the NSA should then be asked whether the list thus produced is acceptable for translation into the implementation plan in terms of COMINT facilities. With this in mind, he said, the group believed it advisable to get ahead with the problem by attempting to prepare a CRL.

CAPTAIN HOLTWICK said that NSA is perfectly willing to sit in now and give its best advice to the rest of the community in its effort to prepare something which NSA can use as basic guidance.

The CHAIRMAN, stating that this is what he has in mind, asked if the members were willing to have a special meeting next week to discuss basic guidance to NSA, and determine whether TAB C or something else is the proper vehicle.

LT. COLONEL HARROLD recalled informing the group that the Air Force had begun preparation of an Air Force CRL based on requirements from all sources. He said that the exercise is continuing, ~~but that he had some doubt as to whether it would do the trick.~~ USCIB: 9.3/86

USCIB: 9.3/40

- 9 -

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~~~SECRET - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 9.3/40

The CHAIRMAN asked if Lt. Colonel Harrold was prepared to discuss it now or later, and was informed that the Air Force would be in a better position to discuss it next week with no guarantee that the list will be complete at that time.

LT. COLONEL HARROLD expressed his opinion that it would be desirable for each agency to prepare its own list, and, while the lists would undoubtedly be overlapping, he thought that they could be combined into a single list which would provide adequate guidance for NSA.

The CHAIRMAN stated that the whole problem is a very complex one. He said that while he felt reasonably sure that the Board did not expect the Committee to reach a solution at this meeting, he hoped the Committee would be able to report some progress in that direction.

MR. GODEL commented that progress has definitely been made if the Committee agrees to follow the course suggested by Lt. Colonel Harrold. He asked if the members, excepting Air Force and Defense, were reasonably well along with the preparation of individual lists.

It was brought out that in addition to the list prepared by CIA progress is being made on a State Department List. The remaining members were of the opinion that the CIA list, with some amendments, could serve as an adequate basis for guidance.

MR. POLYZOIDES expressed agreement with Lt. Colonel Harrold's suggestion that individual lists be prepared and consolidated.

The CHAIRMAN, after determining that there was general agreement on this point, asked when such lists would be available for consideration.

LT. COLONEL HARROLD said that he could not be ready next week and suggested a special meeting just prior to the next USCIB meeting.

The members then discussed format, agreeing in general that it would be advisable to keep in mind the National Intelligence Objectives (NIO) as prepared by the IAC. When [redacted] suggested that the members endeavor to follow the pattern of the CIA list in the interest of facility of consolidation the Chairman commented that there is considerable anarchy of opinion on format and proposed that this be left to the judgment of the individual members.

Returning to the question of an appropriate time to consider the lists, it was generally agreed that a definite date would not be set since many factors are involved. It was agreed, further, that the Board would be informed of the type of action being taken on this point.

USCIB: 9.3/40

- 10 -

OGA

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~~~SECRET U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 9.3/40

The members then discussed the proposal by the Acting Chairman, USCIB (General Cabell) and agreed to inform the Board that the proposal was noted and that the Committee believes it is proceeding in accordance with the spirit and intent of it.

Discussion then turned to the matter of supplemental guidance. The Chairman paused to request reflection by the members on the overall problem itself, without referring to any papers. He outlined his idea of what the supplemental guidance mechanism should be. He described a simple business relationship and indicated how he thought it would work in practice. He suggested a system of checks and balances which ought to obtain, and indicated channels of appeal through the USCIB structure in the event any member believed that his interests were not being served properly. He concluded by saying that he could foresee this as a workable solution which would not offer an unfair advantage to any participant if, in fact, the individual agencies would designate representatives clothed with authority to speak for their principals on matters of supplemental guidance.

In the ensuing discussion Lt. Colonel Harrold indicated that it would be impractical for the Air Force to have a single representative because of the variety of problems involved. He was informed that the main point was to have one person who could act authoritatively on a given problem, thereby getting away from Committee decisions, and that there need be no restriction upon having different individuals for different problems.

The CHAIRMAN added, on this point, that there need be no restriction on the number or composition of panels or advisory groups in the background so long as one person is empowered to express a single, authoritative agency view.

OGA

At the request of the Chairman summed up the proposal briefly and asked if the members were willing to proceed with the basic idea he had presented.

It was generally felt that the area of agreement described by the Chairman, and his recommended course of action, presented a likely means of solution. It was believed, further, that if the Chairman's views were reduced to writing and circulated for comment by the members, the paper might well serve as USCIBEC's recommendations to USCIB in the matter.

The CHAIRMAN volunteered to undertake the preparation of a paper on supplemental guidance along the lines he had described, and said that he would provide all members with copies of it upon completion.

It was agreed that the need for a special meeting would be determined after the proposal has been distributed.

USCIB: 9.3/40

- 11 -

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~~~SECRET - U.S. EYES ONLY~~

USCIB: 9.3/40

DECISION: (25 March 1955) USCIBEC agreed:

(1) With regard to the preparation of a COMINT Requirements List (CRL), that each member so desiring would submit its own CRL to the Executive Secretary with a view to consolidating the individual lists at a special meeting to be arranged when the lists become available.

(2) With regard to Supplemental Guidance, that the Executive Secretary would reduce to writing the views expressed by him in the foregoing discussion, and distribute his proposal for comment by the members, with a view to having it serve as the Committee's recommendation to the Board on Supplemental Guidance.

(Note: The initial proposal was distributed as an enclosure with USCIB 9.3/38. The USCIBEC-approved version was submitted to the Board as USCIB 9.3/39 for consideration at the 114th meeting.)

The meeting adjourned at 1632.

USCIB: 9.3/40

- 12 -

~~SECRET~~