MEMORANDUM FOR THE DIRECTOR, NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY:

Subject: Release to Canada of NSA Scientific Advisory Board Report Entitled "The Potentialities of COMINT for Strategic Warning."

Reference: USCIB 3.5/5 dtd 1 June 1954.

1. In reply to the reference the enclosed comments have been received from the Army, Navy, Air Force, and CIA members of USCIBEC.

2. These enclosures are forwarded pursuant to the USCIBEC-USCIB decision set forth in paragraph 2 of the reference.

Very respectfully,

RUFUS L. TAYLOR
Captain, U. S. Navy
Executive Secretary, USCIB

Enclosures

a/s

COPY

Declassified and approved for release by NSA on 09-26-2014 pursuant to E.O. 13526
MEMORANDUM FOR: EXECUTIVE SECRETARY, USCIB

SUBJECT: Deletions from the Robertson Report (C)

It is requested the following be deleted from the Robertson Report, for the reasons indicated, prior to its release to Canada:

a. Page 4, Paragraph 3. Delete the words "both civilian and military" from the first sentence. Delete the last sentence. Army does not agree that the military personnel policies of the U.S. Army should be revised. In addition, Army does not consider that such internal U.S. matters should be released to Canada.

b. Page 6, first paragraph. Delete reference to Appendix III and delete Appendix III. Army does not consider that USCIB is authorized to release military operational data of the type included in Appendix III.

c. Pages 20 and 21. Delete both pages. ELINT matters are not under USCIB cognizance and the Army does not consider that USCIB is authorized to release any data on U.S. ELINT arrangements and problems to Canada.

d. Page 60. Delete paragraph on Intercept Operators. See paragraph 1 above.

e. Page 67. Delete Appendix X. See paragraph 3 above.

FOR THE ASSISTANT CHIEF OF STAFF, G-2

/s/ THOMAS M. LARNER
THOMAS M. LARNER
Colonel, GS
Chief, Plans and Policy
Office
MEMORANDUM

From: Navy Member, USCIBEC
To: Executive Secretary, USCIB

Subj: NSASAB report; deletions from

Ref: (a) USCIB 3.5/5

1. It is considered that this report does not adequately survey the potentialities of COMINT and that the emphasis as placed on the various phases of the problem renders the conclusions questionable. In view of this the Navy Member, USCIBEC feels it impracticable to indicate other than the following specific deletions in response to reference (a):

   a. Page 13, second sentence
   b. Page 26, fifth sentence
   c. Page 38, second paragraph
   d. Page 42, entire section headed "Delivery of Intelligence Information"
   e. Page 43, fourth sentence under "Discussion"

2. It is recommended that, regardless of deletions, the covering letter stress that the report is not intended to reflect the views of USCIB and that it is forwarded only as a matter of interest and for study.

   /s/ W. M. McCOMMIT
   Captain, USN
MEMORANDUM FOR EXECUTIVE SECRETARY, USCIB

SUBJECT: (Unclassified) Recommended Changes to Robertson Report

1. Reference is made to the decision on Item 1 rendered by USCIBEC at its 15th Meeting.

2. It is requested that the following deletions be made to the expurgated version of the Robertson Report before its release to the Canadians:

   a. Page 20 - Delete the following clause from the first sentence "... but the degree of coordination among the services and with the COMINT effort is at present unsatisfactory from a warning standpoint."

   b. Page 21 - Delete the following "Deficiencies in the ELINT program from the warning standpoint are:" and paragraphs 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5, thereafter.

   c. Page 39 - Delete the fourth paragraph.

   d. Pages 29-40 - Delete from last paragraph the second sentence which begins on page 39 and ends on page 40.

   e. Page 40 - Delete the word "such" from the sentence near the top of the page beginning with the words "More effective utilization...". Delete paragraph near bottom of the page beginning with the words "Additionally, it is particularly ..."

   f. Pages 67-72 - Delete entire Appendix X.

3. It is understood that USCIBEC agreed that the Canadians would be advised that the Robertson Report is advisory in nature and does not necessarily reflect official U.S. views.

FOR THE CHIEF OF STAFF:

F. J. HARROLD
Lt. Colonel, USAF
Directorate of Intelligence
MEMORANDUM FOR: Executive Secretary, USCIB

SUBJECT: Canadian Request for Copies of NSA Scientific Advisory Board Report Entitled "The Potentialities of COMINT for Strategic Warning."

1. Pursuant to a decision reached at the 15th meeting of USCIBEC, 28 May 1954, CIA recommends that the material pertaining to personnel (pp. 25-27, 51-62 and the reference on p. 16) be deleted from the expurgated version of the NSA Scientific Advisory Board report, "The Potentialities of COMINT for Strategic Warning," forwarded under USCIB: 3.5/3, 4 May 1954, prior to its transmission to Canadian authorities.

2. In the event that the report is not retyped, a statement substantially as follows should be inserted on a new page 25: "Material pertaining to internal personnel problems, covering pages 25-27 and Appendix VIII of the original report, has been omitted."

3. THIS DOCUMENT CONTAINS COMMUNICATIONS INTELLIGENCE INFORMATION AND SHALL BE HANDLED ONLY IN CHANNELS EXPRESSLY PROVIDED FOR COMINT.

HUNTINGTON D. SHELDON
CIA MEMBER, USCIB

OGA